

## Learning from the Kiss Nightclub Fire Karen Boyce



#### Acknowledgements

- Prof. Eng. Luiz Carlos Pinto da Silva Filho (coordenador), diretor do Centro Universitário de Estudos e Pesquisa sobre Desastres (CEPED/RS) e Diretor da Escola de Engenharia (EE) da UFRGS;
- Eng. Carlos Wengrover (coordenador adjunto), coordenador do Comitê Brasileiro de Segurança contra Incêndio da ABNT
- **Dr Rodrigo Machado Tavares,** Fire Safety Engineer at RMT Fire & Crowd Safety





- Kiss nightclub, Santa Maria (Rio Grande do Sul), Brazil, Sunday 27<sup>th</sup> January 2013
- Blaze began at approx 02.30 local time during performance by Gurizada Fandangueira (country music band)
- Caused by pyrotechnics igniting flammable ceiling
- 242 deaths, 168 injuries











- Band lit sputnik on stage which ignited flammable sound proofing foam on ceiling
- Flare was cheap (\$1.25?) and can reach 4m (Brazilian Association of Pyrotechnics) not to be used in closed environments
- Band originally claimed that they hadn't used sputnik but rather fire caused by electrical short circuit disproved
- Ignited flammable sound-proofing on ceiling



The



During the Fire

- 1000+ occupants
- Initially band were passed a fire extinguisher which didn't work
- People (briefly) prevented from leaving because they hadn't paid their bar tab (comanda)
- Fire department was close and arrived quickly (occupants using social media to inform) but already hampered by bodies blocking exit
- Partygoers helped firefighters pound windows and walls to free trapped - 90% died of asphyxiation







Area 1 (left)



Area 1 - stage









- April 2013 two nightclub owners and two band members accused of "negligent homicide"
- Others (including firemen) charged with obstructing course of justice false information used by the club and approved by the fire department



- Brazil population: 198 million
- Santa Maria in Rio Grande do Sul, southern state in Brazil (borders Uruquay and Argentina)
- State has population of 10.7 million
- Highest standard of living in Brazil





## Brazilian System of Regulation

- In 1970's fire in Sao Paolo (Joelma Building, 1974, 189 deaths, 320 injured) prompted safety regulations (prescriptive) that became national model BUT
- In reality each state (including Rio Grande do Sul) individually creates its own regulations
- Either can be used and different states have different guidance
- Often eg in Sao Paolo you can find 3 different stair sizing approaches (using Fire Safety Standard NBR9077, Sao Paolo's own regulation or a 'city hall building code')



## Brazilian System of Regulation

- Fire department are the controlling authority they develop regulations and approve
- Calls for agreed national fire safety regulations but being resisted by fire departments of each state which each claim to have the best!
- Under the Ministry of Labour, there is Health and Safety Law which requires frequent checks (and issuing of certificates) but rarely enforced



History of the Kiss Nightclub – Occupancy changes

- Built in the 1950s, originally a warehouse
- In 2003 changed use to a small college
- In 2009 significant refurbishment to nightclub





- first license for the club issued August 2009 after receipt of a fire safety strategy for the nightclub
- last inspection took place in August 2011 (expired)
- stated that the club had two emergency exits and had sufficient extinguishers, licensed for 691 people



#### Post Fire Certificate

- February 2012 refurbishment of the stage, ticket office, built dressing room, mezzanine, and VIP area also with mezzanine
- November 2012, put in suspended ceiling (1.5 m below original) with flammable acoustic lining
- Demolished internal walls
- All without permission or without informing authorities







## Active Systems (Required v Reality)

- At minimum a manual detection and alarm system (it had none)
- Emergency lighting (had but didn't work)
- 12 fire extinguishers (had 7 and at least one didn't work)
- Did not require or have sprinklers or smoke control



Means of Escape (Required v Reality)

- Occupancy classifications similar to purpose grouping but more specific – F6 club
- Fire certificate licensed for 691 (floor space factors for an F6 building would suggest 1230 (based on 615 m<sup>2</sup>)
- Estimates of numbers vary (range from 1000-1500) but, according to ex-employees, 1400 was commonplace



#### Means of Escape Requirements v Reality

- Number of exits depends on occupancy and size of building (> or < 750 m<sup>2</sup>), no requirements for remoteness – this building required 2 exits (it had 2 exits from space which merged at 1 final exit)
- Exit sizing based on unit width/100 people (5.5 mm/person) ie 3.8 m (plans suggest 2 x 1.8m (front entrance) but other sources suggest 2 x 0.8m and pictures?)
- Travel distance depends on 1 or more exits and sprinkler/no sprinkler) – in this case 40m (max travel distanced reported to be 32 m)





Entrance and Exit





Escape routes Area 2





Exit corridor with stairs and 'foyer' at exit



Logo que perceberam o fogo e a fumaça, as pessoas que estavam perto do palco começaram a correr procurando a saída para a rua





Em meio ao tumulto e devido ao ambiente escuro, muitos foram parar nos banheiros numa tentativa de escapar pelas janelas, mas o revestimento da fachada impediu que elas fossem abertas



### Regulatory response

- State of Rio Grande do Sul published new guidance (December 2013) based on guidance already adopted by other states eg Sao Paolo
- Addresses use of fire retardant materials, the use of sprinklers and smoke control (check list)
- Groups calling for fire safety engineering but concerns over technical innovations
- Smoke control for pressurized stairs (NBR 14880: 2014) has just been published and it will be officially valid for use on 8th February 2014



# Could these deaths have been avoided?

- Multiple death fires rarely just one reason or one person
- Fire safety depends on appropriate actions and decisions being made:
  - **during** the fire by occupants/staff and
  - (arguably more importantly) prior to the fire by design team, management and inspecting authorities



#### Not the first time....

- *"The reason they died was the search for profit..."* prosecutor Joel Dutra (Kiss)
- Station Nightclub, Rhode Island (2003):
  - Overcrowding
  - Flammable wall/ceiling coverings
  - Inadequate fire suppression devices
  - Improper use of pyrotechnics
  - Inadequate exits





#### Thankyou for Listening!







